

EXHIBIT GG

In the Matter Of:

FREEMAN v

DEEBS-ELKENANEY

CAROLE CHASKI, PH.D.

September 28, 2023



1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

UNITED DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
-----X
LYNNE FREEMAN, an individual,
Plaintiff,
Civil Action No.
VS. 1:22-cv-02435-LLS-SN
TRACY DEEBS-ELKENANEY P/K/A
TRACY WOLFF, an individual,
EMILY SYLVAN KIM, an individual,
PROSPECT AGENCY, LLC, a New
Jersey Limited Liability Company,
ENTANGLED PUBLISHING, LLC, a
Delaware Limited Liability
Company, HOLTZBRINCK PUBLISHERS,
LLC D/B/A MACMILLAN, a New York
Limited Liability Company, and
UNIVERSAL STUDIOS, LLC, a
Delaware Limited Liability Company,
Defendants.
-----X

REMOTE VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION

OF

CAROLE E. CHASKI, Ph.D.

Thursday, September 28, 2023

Reported by:
AYLETTE GONZALEZ, RPR, CLR, CCR
JOB NO. 2023-911535

DATE: September 28, 2023

TIME: 12:00 p.m.

Remote videotaped deposition of
CAROLE E. CHASKI, Ph.D., pursuant to
NOTICE, before AYLETTE GONZALEZ, a
Registered Professional Reporter, Certified
LiveNote Reporter, Certified Court Reporter
and Notary Public of the States of New
York, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Delaware
and Texas.

R E M O T E A P P E A R A N C E S :

DONIGER / BURROUGHS LAW FIRM

Counsel for Plaintiff

LYNNE FREEMAN

603 Rose Avenue

Venice, California 90291

BY: STEPHEN M. DONIGER, ESQ.

EMAIL: stephen@donigerlawfirm.com

COWAN, DeBAETS, ABRAHAMS & SHEPPARD LLP

Counsel for Defendants

TRACY DEEBS-ELKENANEY P/K/A TRACY WOLFF,

ENTANGLED PUBLISHING, LLC, HOLTZBRINCK

PUBLISHERS, LLC d/b/a MACMILLAN and

UNIVERSAL CITY STUDIOS LLC

41 Madison Avenue

New York, New York 10010

BY: BENJAMIN HALPERIN, ESQ.

EMAIL: bhalperin@cdas.com

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

R E M O T E A P P E A R A N C E S :

ALSO PRESENT:

JACOB FIGUEROA, Videographer

TRENT BAER

EMILY KIM

MARK PASSIN

1 DR. CHASKI (9/28/2023)

2 but I don't remember details of it.

3 Q. I'm going to represent to you
4 that the longest shared sequence that
5 Dr. Juola identifies in his report is the
6 sequence, "the ground to open up and
7 swallow me," which is nine words unless my
8 math is wrong.

9 A. Okay.

10 Q. Does that sound right, nine
11 words?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And he took that from a 2011
14 version of BMR, are you aware of that?

15 A. I believe you.

16 Q. Do you know whether the 2011
17 version of BMR actually contains the
18 phrase, "the ground to open up and swallow
19 me"?

20 A. No, I could check it, but I'd
21 have to go into my software and it would
22 take you -- it would take time you don't
23 want to spend on that.

24 Q. I appreciate you looking out,
25 but I think we have a quicker way is we

1 DR. CHASKI (9/28/2023)

2 could go to paragraph 81 of your report.

3 A. Okay. Okay.

4 Q. So in paragraph 81, you
5 identified a phrase -- two phrases from
6 2011 BMR and one from Tracy Wolff's Crave
7 book. In the first one is the example from
8 BMR and that reads, "I wanted the ground to
9 just open up and swallow me," correct?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. So that is not the same as "the
12 ground to open up and swallow me," because
13 it also includes the word "just," correct?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. So it would be wrong to say
16 based on what you write in paragraph 81,
17 that both works contain the phrase, the
18 exact phrase, "the ground to open up and
19 swallow me," correct?

20 A. Right. I would see
21 paragraph 81 as an example of mosaic
22 plagiarism, and I'm assuming Dr. Juola saw
23 it as an example of words in a row
24 copy-paste plagiarism.

25 Q. Sitting here today, are you

1 DR. CHASKI (9/28/2023)

2 aware of any evidence showing that Tracy
3 Wolff copied a ten-word sequence from BMR?

4 A. Not in my -- I don't believe I
5 have that in my report.

6 Q. Sitting here today, are you
7 aware of any evidence that Tracy Wolff
8 copied a single nine-word sequence from
9 BMR?

10 A. I don't know because my focus
11 was not on words in a row.

12 Q. Sitting here today, are you
13 aware of any evidence that Tracy Wolff
14 copied a single eight-word sequence from
15 BMR?

16 A. Well, my examples are all about
17 mosaic plagiarism so we're not going to
18 find that in my report.

19 Q. And you're not aware of any
20 other examples?

21 A. I wasn't looking for them.

22 Q. Have you seen any evidence that
23 Tracy Wolff copied a whole paragraph from
24 BMR in writing the Crave books?

25 A. No, I wasn't looking for that

1 DR. CHASKI (9/28/2023)

2 either.

3 Q. Have you seen any evidence that
4 Tracy Wolff also copied a single complete
5 sentence from BMR?

6 A. Word-for-word, you mean
7 copy-paste?

8 Q. Yes.

9 A. No.

10 Q. So one thing you did focus on
11 was mosaic plagiarism, correct?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. What's mosaic plagiarism?

14 A. Mosaic plagiarism is where the
15 source document is paraphrased using the
16 standard syntactic techniques,
17 substitution, insertion, deletion,
18 permutation, so that the source material is
19 transformed into mostly different syntactic
20 structures, but says the same thing as the
21 source.

22 Q. Explain to me what specifically
23 step-by-step your methodology is for
24 detecting mosaic plagiarism into novel
25 length books.

1 DR. CHASKI (9/28/2023)

2
3 J U R A T

4
5
6 I, CAROLE E. CHASKI, Ph.D., do
7 hereby certify under penalty of
8 perjury that I have read the
9 foregoing transcript of my deposition
10 taken on September 28, 2023; that I
11 have made such corrections as appear
12 noted herein in ink, initialed by me;
13 that my testimony as contained
14 herein, as corrected, is true and
15 correct.

16
17
18 _____
CAROLE E. CHASKI, Ph.D.

19
20 Subscribed and sworn to before me

21 This _____ day of _____, 2023.

22
23 _____
NOTARY PUBLIC

DR. CHASKI (9/28/2023)

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)
COUNTY OF RICHMOND) : SS.:

I, AYLETTE GONZALEZ, a Notary
Public for and within the State of New
York, do hereby certify:

That the witness, CAROLE E.
CHASKI, Ph.D., whose examination is
hereinbefore set forth was duly sworn and
that such examination is a true record of
the testimony given by that witness.

I further certify that I am not
related to any of the parties to this
action by blood or by marriage and that I
am in no way interested in the outcome of
this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have
hereunto set my hand this 7th day of
October, 2023.



AYLETTE GONZALEZ